

**PERSONNEL COMMITTEE MEETING
HELD IN ROOM 318
PUTNAM COUNTY OFFICE BUILDING
CARMEL, NEW YORK 10512**

Members: Chairwoman Nacerino, Legislators Albano and Jonke

Monday **6:00p.m.** **October 16, 2017**

The meeting was called to order at 6:00p.m. by Chairwoman Nacerino who requested Legislator Jonke lead in the Pledge of Allegiance. Upon roll call Chairwoman Nacerino and Legislators Albano and Jonke were present.

Item #3) Presentation by: Benistar Group-Retirement Health Solutions

Chairwoman Nacerino stated she has been notified that the representatives from Benistar Group are delayed in traffic and should be here shortly. She stated therefore the meeting will begin with the review of the 2018 budget items. She stated once the representatives arrive, the meeting discussion will pause, and the presentation will be given.

Item #4) 2018 Budget Review

Unemployment Ins. (Page 211)

Commissioner of Finance William Carlin stated that \$30,000 a year is a standard amount. He explained that even though there are not layoffs in the County, there are situations when an employee willingly leaves their job with the County and gets unemployed at another job, the County is back charged for the prorated part of the year. He stated it is the law.

Personnel Director Paul Eldridge stated the County has been advocating to change that for a while, without success.

Accident/Health Insurance (Page 213)

Commissioner of Finance Carlin stated that the Empire Health Insurance rates are up an average of 8%. He stated that there is no sign of the increases stopping. He stated that is why the County continues to look for other health care insurance options. He stated that is the reason Personnel Director Eldridge has the presentation being made tonight by the Benistar Group.

2018 Management Adjustments

Commissioner of Finance Carlin questioned if the committee wanted to address the management adjustments in Executive Session or in the open forum. He stated if the discussion is going to speak to an individual and not the positions, he recommends Executive Session.

Legislator LoBue stated that she would prefer that the discussion not be done in Executive Session. She stated the position should be referred to and not the individual person. She stated she believes it is for the benefit of the Public who were present at the meeting. She stated the Personnel Budget has been discussed in public in past years.

Chairwoman Nacerino stated she will begin the review of the 2018 Proposed Positions. She stated that Commissioner of Highways & Facilities Fred Pena, Retired Commissioner of Bureau of Emergency Services Anthony Sutton, Youth Director Janeen Cunningham and Director of Office for Senior Resources Pat Sheehy did discuss the proposed positions in other committee budget meetings. She stated that tonight they will be addressed again, providing an opportunity for additional questions to be presented.

Director of Personnel Paul Eldridge explained that the position of Bureau of Emergency Services Page 35 (398910111) of the Personnel section of the budget is shifting the funding from the Temporary Account to the Personnel Services line.

Commissioner of Finance William Carlin stated the Emergency Services Director position page 37 (398910115) is a reclassification of the Deputy Commissioner of Emergency Services position. He stated it was decided to have this position that would have an emphasis on emergency preparedness.

Chairwoman Nacerino stated that is correct. She stated that she recalled Retired Commissioner Sutton speaking in detail to this proposed position and his support. She stated that the necessity to restructure and make things more effective and efficient moving forward. She stated a lot of the departments made that assessment for this year's budget and that is why these proposed positions and funding transfers and reclassification of titles. She stated it is in an effort to improve and be more effective moving forward in 2018.

Legislator Jonke questioned if the Emergency Services Director will be a tested position.

Personnel Director Eldridge stated he believes it will be outside the competitive class.

Chairwoman Nacerino questioned if all of the positions listed in the Office for Senior Resources are in support of the new Butterfield Senior Center, because they all have an effective date of March 1, 2018.

Personnel Director Eldridge stated that is correct. The six (6) positions are all on page 6 of the Personnel Portion of the 2018 Tentative Budget : Caseworker- P/T – 25 HPW Effective 3/1/18 (677410121), Typist/ Office Asst – P/T -25 HPW – Effective 3/1/18 (677410122), Food Service Helper– P/T -25 HPW – Effective 3/1/18 (677410123), CDL Drive– P/T -25 HPW – Effective 3/1/18 (677410124), CDL Driver– P/T -25 HPW – Effective 3/1/18 (677410125), Non-CDL Driver- Effective 3/1/18 (677410126).

Legislator LoBue stated that she saw an ad in the newspaper for a Grant Writer to be employed by the County. She questioned where that position is in the budget.

Personnel Director Eldridge stated that he did not place an ad in the paper for a Grant Writer. Legislator LoBue stated that the (3) three positions for Drivers, two (2) CDL and one Non- CDL Driver are all to support Butterfield.

Chairwoman Nacerino stated that is correct. She stated that was part of the grant funding (Reso #200/17) that was discussed recently.

Office For Senior Resources Director Pat Sheehy stated that she would like to request the Confidential Secretary position page 73 (677210903) be given an increase. She stated in terms of creating parity among the Confidential Secretary positions throughout the County, which has been discussed. She stated that Confidential Secretary positions throughout the County have very different responsibilities. She stated that the services that are provided by the OSR (Office For Senior Resources) are required to be provided every day. She stated that the person in the Confidential Secretary position in the department always jumps in and takes on a lot of additional responsibilities. She stated with the Cost of Living Adjust (COLA) plus the increase of \$1,627 approved by the Administration, the salary of the said position would be \$47,000. She stated that she is requesting an additional \$3,000 be approved to bring the position up to \$50,000.

Chairwoman Nacerino questioned if this employee did get an increase when they moved into this position, just a few years back.

Personnel Director Eldridge stated yes, a very nominal increase.

Chairwoman Nacerino stated the 2018 requested increase was for \$5,680 and the Administration approved \$1,627.

Legislator Albano stated that he would support splitting the difference. He stated that he would support giving an additional \$1,500.

Legislator LoBue questioned what would be the percentage increase.

Legislator Albano stated it is hard to talk percentage when you are starting with a lower base.

Legislator LoBue stated she believes the percentage is important because what is approved sets a precedent. She stated the increase as it is in the tentative budget is a 6.05% increase.

Legislator Albano stated if the salary is low to begin with, the percentage amount means less.

Chairwoman Nacerino stated she disagrees that a precedent is being set. She stated the committee is reviewing and considering adjustments based on recommendations being brought forward.

Legislator LoBue stated that she is sure that every employee believes and is deserving of an increase. She stated when employees are singled out, case by case she believes that is a slippery slope to go down.

Chairwoman Nacerino stated the reality of those situations is that parity can never be 100%. She stated as an example, County CSEA employees who make a higher salary than their Managers. She stated the union employees have step increases and longevity over time. She stated the County Management positions do not have that. She stated that is why the Management positions are reviewed and discussed. She stated decisions on the Management employee salaries are made based on the merit of the recommendation. She stated it can never be totally uniformed and fair across the board. She stated it is just not how the system works with Union employees and Management employees.

Item #3) Presentation by: Benistar Group-Retirement Health Solutions

6:25p.m. Chairwoman Nacerino stated that the Benistar Group Representatives had arrived. She stated that the presentation will begin. She stated this discussion will be paused for the time being and will resume at the conclusion of this matter.

Brian Miles, Spain Agency stated he would like to thank Personnel Director Eldridge and his team, Senior Deputy County Attorney For Risk & Compliance Adrienne Lotto, Principle Personnel Specialist Donna Garofalo and Confidential Secretary Jan Miller for all of their work and effort in spearheading a review of the benefits offered in Putnam County, particularly the health care benefits for the Putnam County retired employees. He stated the Spain Agency reached out to the Benistar Group Company. He stated Benistar Group specializes in these types of policies and procedures. He stated Don Trudeau, representative from Benistar Group, specializes in these types of policies and procedures. He stated Benistar Group is located in Avon, Connecticut. He stated Benistar Group is a third party administrator that handles these types of policies.

Don Trudeau, representative from Benistar Group apologized for arriving late. He explained he was stuck in traffic due to an accident on 684. He stated that he was brought in to do tonight's presentation because Glen Anderson, whose name is on the first page of this presentation, is sick with strep throat. He began the presentation (a copy is attached to the minutes).

Personnel Director Eldridge stated this is a voluntary program. He stated the Retirees can remain with their current coverage if they choose so.

Don Trudeau, representative from Benistar Group stated there will be two (2) programs offered to the Medicare Eligible Retired employees of Putnam County. He stated the Primary Program basically mirrors the benefit level of New York State Health Insurance Program (NYSHIP). He stated it is essentially close to a Plan "F". He stated the intended portion they would be offering is to result with a cost savings. He stated the second part is the Prescription Drug portion. He continued to highlight the offerings of the Benistar Group.

Senior Deputy County Attorney For Risk & Compliance Adrienne Lotto stated there will be three (3) informational sessions provided. She stated that Benistar, in addition to the informational sessions, has agreed to meet with any County retiree to go over the list of their medications and physicians and provide information on exactly how much the individual's copays would be if they choose to go with Benistar. She stated the informational sessions will also

be available on a webinar, which will be available on the County's web page, in the event a retiree cannot attend any of the three (3) sessions.

Personnel Director Eldridge stated the three (3) dates of the Informational Seminars are: November 1, November 17 and November 22 of 2017 from 9:00a.m. – 11:30a.m. in the Auditorium in the Bureau of Emergency Services. He stated he truly believes, if people take the time to get the information related to this program, it will sell itself.

Legislator Addonizio questioned if an employee switches to Benistar, but decides they want to go back to NYSHIP, would they be able to do that.

Personnel Director Eldridge stated yes, during the open enrollment period, unless there is major life event.

Chairwoman Nacerino questioned if the Retirees have been apprised of this proposed program.

Personnel Director Eldridge stated they wanted to make sure that the Legislature was on board with this proposal. He stated there have been conversations with the Retirees for the past year and a half. He stated the County Executive included this proposal in her presentation of the 2018 Budget. He stated since then, he has received a number of phone calls from Retirees who are anxious to learn more about the proposal. He stated there is communication that will be going out this week to all of the Retirees inviting them to attend one of the sessions, or to view it through accessing the Webinar.

Don Trudeau, representative from Benistar Group continued with the presentation and he did address a few questions from members of the audience.

Chairwoman Nacerino questioned what the average net savings would be to a retiree under this plan if they selected the highest cost option plan.

Personnel Director Eldridge stated approximately 14%. He stated there are many contributing factors to state an amount specifically. He stated it will depend on the Retirees pension amount, which dictates the percentage that they pay for their health insurance.

Chairwoman Nacerino stated that is a significant savings. She stated that from the presentation she is hearing that this proposed plan is twofold: It does not compromise in terms of the benefits, in fact it enhances and it will result in a savings, no matter how small or how great.

Personnel Director Eldridge stated also the significant point is that it is voluntary.

Legislator Jonke questioned if the retirees will be allowed to bring their current coverage facts and their personal needs and sit with someone who will assist them in looking at the different options, at the November meetings.

Personnel Director Eldridge stated the November meeting will be to address a large group to get the Retirees familiar with the program. He stated after that, one on one meeting can be set up.

Legislator Jonke stated he believes it is important for the Retirees to have an opportunity to speak to someone to ask “what does this mean to me”.

Personnel Director Eldridge stated absolutely.

Don Trudeau, representative from Benistar Group stated they will have individuals available for the Retirees to meet with one on one. He stated in most cases it comes down to a couple of items: 1) What will I have to pay 2) Does this new plan cover my medication and if so at what co-pay level and 3) Are my Doctors covered in the plan

Legislator LoBue questioned when would be the deadline to make the switch.

Personnel Director Eldridge stated that has not been nailed down yet. He stated most likely it will be mid December 2017.

Legislator Castellano requested confirmation that the NYSHIP plan does not offer a plan for just two people.

Personnel Director Eldridge stated that is correct. He stated NYSHIP offers a single plan or a family plan. He stated that is a large part of the challenge with the NYSHIP plan.

Chairwoman Nacerino asked if there were any other questions, which there were none. She thanked Don Trudeau and Brian Miles for bringing the information forward to the Personnel Committee.

Item #4 – Continued:

Chairwoman Nacerino stated they will resume the discussion regarding Management Adjustments. She stated she believes the increase in the budget is fair, it has a variance of 6.05%.

Office for Senior Resources Director Sheehy stated she could not hear Chairwoman Nacerino. She questioned if she is making the proposal that Legislator Albano suggested in splitting the difference.

Chairwoman Nacerino stated no that was not the recommendation she was making. She stated she believes the \$2,680 increase approved by the Administration is significant as it stands.

Legislator Jonke questioned if the 2018 Tentative salary of \$47,000 for said position includes the COLA and the increase.

Office for Senior Resources Director Sheehy stated yes. She stated that this position’s salary was low to begin with. She stated that last year when she came forward, the Legislature suggested splitting the difference and if the Legislature were to recommend splitting it again, it does not get this person and the position the compensation that it should be. She stated she will be retiring this year, and she believes the individual in this position is going to be substantial

support to the incoming Director. She stated it appears to her that if a Confidential Secretary position becomes available, the salary stays at that rate, so there is a risk that this person may leave this job to a better paying Confidential Secretary position, which would be very unfortunate for the Office for Senior Resources Department. She stated she believes this is worth giving some consideration to. She stated historically the Management positions have not been properly adjusted over time. She stated the previous secretary who left this position, she believes had a salary in the mid \$60,000s . She stated in the negotiations of moving the current employee from one position in the County to the position being discussed, the salary was reduced. She stated she does not believe the equity is there for this employee.

Legislator Albano stated that Butterfield will be opening next year. He stated that will generate a lot of activity with the Seniors. He stated that he believes the salary is low for a Confidential Secretary, and that he again recommends splitting the increase. He stated that he would like to see the 2018 Salary for the said position to be \$48,500.

Legislator LoBue stated to reference of a salary of an individual who left the job as a comparison is not accurate. She stated the person who left could have been in the position for 15 years or longer. She stated therefore receiving salary increases over that 15 year period.

Legislator Albano stated that usually the salary is cut 10% when an employee leaves a position.

Legislator LoBue stated she has not seen any consistency with that practice of cutting a salary 10% when an employee leaves a position.

Legislator Albano stated the employee working in the said position has been working for 11 years.

Legislator LoBue stated not in this position.

Personnel Director Eldridge stated that is correct, not in the said position.

Chairwoman Nacerino stated in good faith she would support increasing the salary to a total for 2018 of \$47,500. She stated however she believes the 6.05% increase approved by the Administration demonstrated that the position warrants an increase.

Legislator Jonke stated that he would support that as well.

Chairwoman Nacerino made a motion to approve the increase of \$500 to position 677210903, Confidential Secretary, Office for Senior Resources; Seconded Legislator Jonke. All in favor.

Chairwoman Nacerino stated they will be reviewing approximately ten (10) of the Management Adjustments that are included in the 2018 Tentative Budget. She stated with that said, it is recognized that all of the employees do a stellar job and every employee is deserving of an increase. She stated that the goal is to strive for parity, however it is really an unrealistic goal. She stated it does not negate the fact that there are certain rationales that are put forth in trying to seek that parity. She stated with that being said the committee will review the list of

Management Adjustments. She stated that she will begin with the two (2) Management – Administrative Assistant positions in the Legislature. She stated that these two (2) employees have brought a great deal of value and expertise to the office. She stated she is very much in favor of the modest increase included in the budget. She stated the next Management positions are in the County Executive’s Office the Chief of Staff and the Confidential Secretary to the County Executive. She stated the County Executive did announce that she will not be filling the recently vacated Deputy County Executive position in 2018. She stated that will result in a \$120,645 cost savings to her particular budget. She stated that she has recommended an increase for the Chief of Staff and Confidential Secretary that work in said office. She stated that the increases sound substantial (Chief of Staff \$4,620 & Confidential Secretary \$8,230) however these two (2) positions have been looked over for the past six (6) years. She stated at this time the County Executive believes and she supports that these two (2) individuals are instrumental to the day to day operations of the County Executive’s office.

Legislator LoBue stated that she does not agree with the analogy that the Deputy County Executive position will not be filled in 2018. She stated that position will be filled in 2019. She stated the position of Chief of Staff increase would be a *4.39% and the Confidential Secretary position increase is **17.33% (a corrected document was provided the next day with corrected percentage increases *6.76% and **19.70%). She stated the County Executive came into office in 2012 and reorganized her office. She stated she reduced the salaries of these two positions to fund a new position in her office, Constituent Services and Driver. She stated every year the County Executive has requested an increase for these two (2) positions. She stated she cannot justify these increases.

Chairwoman Nacerino stated for clarification the savings she referenced by leaving the Deputy County Executive position vacant is for 2018. She stated that does not mean that will be the County Executive’s preference in 2019 or moving forward. She stated the savings referenced by her earlier was in relation to the 2018 budget, which is the budget the Legislature is addressing.

John Morar, Carmel resident stated generally in business when there is a salary gap, as referenced in this case, the salary is brought up incrementally over a period of time. He stated making a huge jump, as in the case with the jump of the Confidential Secretary position generally makes people feel bad in the succeeding years. He stated he is wonder what the justification is for such a big jump in salary.

Chairwoman Nacerino stated that there were not very big increments in the salary over the years.

Lynne Eckardt, Town of Southeast resident stated although there will not be a Deputy County Executive in 2018, the position most likely will be filled in 2019. She stated and who is to say what the salary would be proposed, it could be less or more.

Chairwoman Nacerino stated tonight the 2018 budget is being addressed.

Lynne Eckardt, Town of Southeast resident stated she understands that, however the increases that are being proposed will be ongoing expenses. She stated and in theory there will be a

Deputy County Executive salary. She questioned what other increases are there in the County Executive's office.

Chairwoman Nacerino stated that is it.

Lynne Eckardt, Town of Southeast resident requested confirmation that the County Executive's salary would remain the same.

Chairwoman Nacerino stated COLA that is being given to the Management Employees will be applied to the County Executive's salary as well.

Lynne Eckardt, Town of Southeast resident stated that she believes it is very short sighted to give these amounts of increases and then most likely next year will be looking to hire a Deputy County Executive.

Chairwoman Nacerino stated they are not comingling the two (2) matters. She stated they understand there is a savings this year, so that is duly noted. She stated it does not negate what is being said in regards to the positons that are being discussed this evening. She stated the County Executive's budget is significantly lower than it was last year, and that will be recognized in the consideration of the 2018 budget. She stated that she commends the County Executive for bringing forth a budget that is so solid that the Legislature has not cut one dollar through the review process to date.

Legislator LoBue requested the exact percentage that is being given as the COLA increase.

Commissioner William Carlin stated it is 2.38%.

Legislator LoBue stated for clarification the two (2) management positons in the County Executive's Office would be receiving the COLA increase plus the proposed increases: Chief of Staff \$4,620 & Confidential Secretary \$8,230.

Legislator Jonke stated he believes the discussion of a salary should be of the actual amount and not the percentage amounts. He stated to speak to the comment comparing this to the private business employee. He stated it is not the same, that some of these people may not be in office in 2019. He stated the evaluation is being made of 2018 budget.

Legislator LoBue stated that she respects his opinion. She stated the purpose of tonight is to review what has been proposed.

Legislator Albano stated the two (2) employees in the County Executive's Office, Chief of Staff and the Confidential Secretary do an outstanding job. He stated that they are very responsive when they call and get answers back to them right away. He stated very simply we are taking advantage of the Deputy County Executive vacancy, to do a catch up. He stated that he believes this a good time to bring these salaries closer to where they should be. He stated he is absolutely in favor of these increases.

Legislator LoBue stated that she recalls last year it was decided to provide a copy of the budget to people in the audience so they could follow along.

Chairwoman Nacerino stated unfortunately there are no copies.

Legislator LoBue stated that the Legislative Staff is present and could make the copies.

Chairwoman Nacerino stated that would be her call and she believed it would be too cumbersome. She stated she will continue to read exactly what is being discussed. She stated the next item is the County Law Department. She stated there is an increase in the budget for the County Attorney of \$3,889 and the First Deputy County Attorney of \$4,881. She stated that these are well deserved increases. She stated that both of these County employees have tremendous responsibilities and have been proven to be reliable resources to both the County Executive and the Legislature. She stated that there is an increase in the budget for the Confidential Secretary in the Personnel Department for \$2,362 in addition to an increase in a stipend she received for serving as the secretary to the Board of Ethics. She stated that there is a supposed increase for the Commissioners of Elections, Board of Elections. She stated that in the budget the County Executive has approved a \$6,964 increase for each of the Commissioners. She stated that there has been an increase in the number of primaries and responsibilities to manage over the last several years, which will continue. She stated that she supports this recommendation.

Legislator LoBue stated with the COLA increase the tentative 2018 salary for each of the Commissioners would be \$84,651.00. She stated there is also a proposal for an additional \$5,000 to be given to each Commissioner. If approved it is an approximate 8.42% increase. She stated the Commissioner of Board of Elections in Westchester County makes \$155,000 and oversees a population of approximately 1 million residents. She stated she does not see the justification for the proposed increase.

Legislator Jonke stated there are the same number of elections in Westchester County and Putnam County.

Legislator LoBue stated yes, however the volume of people being handled by Westchester County is vastly more than the number of people in Putnam County. She stated that she would support the COLA increase. She stated that she cannot support the additional \$5,000.

Lynne Eckardt, resident, stated she has been in attendance at many of the Committee meetings. She stated that she has seen County Employees come to Committee meetings requesting raises. She questioned if the Commissioners of Board of Elections had come and spoke to the Legislators directly regarding the increase in their salary.

Chairwoman Nacerino stated they spoke to the County Executive during their budget meetings. She stated that she did speak to Commissioner Board Elections Scannapieco regarding this request.

Lynne Eckardt, resident, stated for confirmation the other members of the Board of Elections Office, the Election Specialists will be getting the COLA.

Chairwoman Nacerino stated that is correct.

Lynne Eckardt, resident, stated she believes there needs to be care taken when raising employees' salaries when they are out of whack with the rest of the office. She stated that is her concern in this instance. She stated for the members of the public, when there is a substantial raise she believes the employees should be present at the meeting to address questions raised.

Chairwoman Nacerino stated she spoke to Commissioner Scannapieco today, who questioned if he should be present at the meeting. She stated she believes Commissioner Croft had a prior commitment and was not available to attend. She stated she felt the explanation put forth in speaking with Commissioner Scannapieco and what was discussed at the County Executive's budget meetings was satisfactory to her.

Lynne Eckardt, resident, questioned if Chairwoman Nacerino knew the number of elections coming up in 2018.

Chairwoman Nacerino stated she does not have that total, but could certainly get it.

Lynne Eckardt, resident, stated she believes that is the type of information that is important to know prior to giving this kind of raise.

Chairwoman Nacerino stated that she would like to add another position to the list of Management Adjustments, Deputy Commissioner of Highways and Facilities. She stated she is proposing a \$5,000 increase for said position. She stated this position's current salary is \$94,572. She stated it is her understanding that this position will be having added responsibilities in 2018 and there will be a reorganization and re-assessment of the duties and responsibilities for this position. She stated the person in the position is well educated and well experienced. She stated when she reviewed the salaries of the employees in this department she noticed that the salaries and overtime of many of the employees exceeded the salary of the Deputy Commissioner of Highways and Facilities by a very large margin. She stated this is a very important position and will continue to be with the continued work of the Capital Projects.

Legislator Albano stated that he agrees the employee is very knowledgeable. He stated he is very aware of the grants and paperwork involved with the grants. He stated 2018 will be very busy with the projects projected.

Legislator Jonke stated that the employee's experience is valuable to the County. He stated also with the changes occurring in that department, he agrees there will be additional responsibilities added to the Deputy Commissioner of Highways and Facilities role. He stated that he agrees with this proposal.

Legislator LoBue stated for clarification the position's current salary is \$94,572.00. She stated with the COLA increase the 2018 Tentative Salary is \$96,818.00 and Chairwoman Nacerino is proposing an additional \$5,000.

Chairwoman Nacerino stated that is not correct. She stated that she is proposing that the COLA increase be negated. She stated her recommendation is to give a \$5,000 raise to the current salary.

Legislator LoBue stated that Chairwoman Nacerino is proposing a \$5,000 increase to the current salary of, \$94,572, which would bring the 2018 salary for the Deputy Commissioner of Highways and Facilities to \$99,572. She questioned what the reorganization, that was referenced, would be.

Legislator Jonke stated that there is an employee moving from the Highways and Facilities Department to a position in a different department.

Legislator LoBue stated that the employee being discussed was the former Deputy County Executive. She questioned if said employee will be assisting the County Executive now.

Chairwoman Nacerino stated not to her knowledge, nor did she allude to that. She stated that she is speaking to the position at hand, and the duties and responsibilities at hand.

Chairwoman Nacerino made a motion to approve an increase of \$5,000 to the 2018 salary of the Deputy Commissioner of Highways and Facilities position; Seconded by Legislator Jonke. All in favor.

Legislator Scuccimarra stated that she would like to propose another increase for an employee. She stated she would like to propose a \$3,000 increase for the Transportation Program Manager. She stated she is proposing that the COLA increase be negated. She stated her recommendation is to give a \$3,000 raise bringing the 2018 salary to \$81,810 for said position. She stated that she believes this employee has proven himself over and over again. She stated the review of the County's transportation system has received excellent ratings.

Legislator Albano stated that he supports that recommendation.

Chairwoman Nacerino stated she would support the recommendation as well.

Chairwoman Nacerino made a motion to approved an increase of \$3,000 to the salary of the Transportation Program Manager position; Seconded by Legislator Albano. All in favor.

Chairwoman Nacerino stated the next category for review is the 2018 Reclassified Positions.

Personnel Director Eldridge stated that each of the positions in this category is either in the Union of CSEA or PUMA. He stated each position has been reviewed and audited.

Chairwoman Nacerino moved onto the list of Vacancies. She stated that most of the positions on the list will be filled.

Personnel Director Eldridge stated that is correct. He stated that there have been some unforeseen occurrences that have resulted in vacancies. He stated he would estimate approximately 90% of the vacancies are being actively pursued to be filled.

Chairwoman Nacerino moved onto the list of County Positions which are paid out of more than one budget line, which are referred to as “Split Positions”.

Barney Molloy, resident questioned what the retained vacancy factor used for planning purposes.

Commissioner of Finance Carlin stated it is \$300,000.

Personnel Director Eldridge stated that the Commissioner of Finance “sweeps” it throughout the year.

Chairwoman Nacerino moved onto the “2016 and Year to Date 2017 Overtime Report by Department and Employee”.

Legislator Albano stated he would like to see the overtime reduced, since there is a long term impact through the pensions in the future; the impact is beyond the numbers seen here.

Personnel Director Eldridge stated there were so many vacancies this year in the Corrections Department, that fact had a direct impact on the amount of overtime incurred. He stated it takes a while to process a hired person for that department. He stated all of the vacancies have been filled. He stated however there will be a transition period of getting all of the new hires trained.

Legislator Jonke stated that was reported to the Legislature during the Protective Budget Meeting.

Legislator LoBue stated there has been an increase of \$5,000 given to each Legislator.

Chairwoman Nacerino stated that is correct. She stated it was submitted as part of the 2018 budget for the Legislature. She stated it will be the first increase to the salary of a Legislator since 2007. She stated the Legislators have had a zero increase every year since 2007. She stated there was an analysis of some of the other Towns and municipalities.

Legislator LoBue stated in 2017 the Legislators received a 2% increase.

Chairwoman Nacerino stated that was a cost of living increase (COLA) in the amount of approximately \$700.

Legislator LoBue stated but it was still an increase.

Chairwoman Nacerino stated that is correct, there was a COLA increase of \$703 for each Legislator in the 2017 budget. She stated prior to that there was a zero increase since 2007. She stated the \$5,000 increase averages out to a 1% increase over all of those years.

Legislator LoBue questioned what the percentage increase is.

Auditor Michele Sharkey stated it is a 13.95%.

Legislator LoBue questioned what the justification was to propose a 13.95% increase.

Chairwoman Nacerino stated if Legislator LoBue is not aware of the justification after serving as a Legislator for the past nine (9) years, she does not believe she could explain it to her.

Legislator LoBue stated as an elected official you take the position based on a desire to do the job, not to get an increase.

Chairwoman Nacerino stated it is a 1% increase when it is calculated over the past decade. She stated she has no reservation about advocating for an increase. She stated the Legislators perform a very important and integral job. She stated an exorbitant amount of hours is spent doing the job. She stated as the senior member of the Legislature, she does not believe she needs to explain that to Legislator LoBue. She stated this is not only a Monday through Friday job, it is most weekends as well. She stated it is her opinion that the value of the position of a Legislator is underscored when the Legislature accepts a zero increase year after year. She stated that she believes this is a fair assessment and well deserved after a decade.

Lynne Eckardt, resident, stated that she believes the increase proposed is very high, as it is almost 14%. She questioned how the Putnam County Legislature compares to other counties.

Legislator Castellano stated the Legislator salary in Westchester County range from \$50,000 to \$90,000.

Lynne Eckardt, resident, questioned if the Legislator position in Westchester is part-time.

Legislator Castellano stated that is correct.

Lynne Eckardt, resident questioned Personnel Director Eldridge if the Legislators have to fill out a Standard Workday recording.

Personnel Director Eldridge stated they do.

Lynne Eckardt, resident questioned if any of the Legislators know the amount of time they put in.

Personnel Director Eldridge stated it varies by person.

Lynne Eckardt questioned if she would need to go through the F.O.I.L. process to get the hours for the Legislators, which were submitted on their standard workday form.

Personnel Director Eldridge stated that would be the quickest way to do that.

Lynne Eckardt stated that it is her opinion that increase of \$5,000 for each Legislator is a really big increase. She stated that she wanted to express her displeasure with that. She questioned if part-time elected officials are entitled to the Health Insurance coverage.

Personnel Director Eldridge stated by the NYSHIP plan that is correct.

Lynne Eckardt, resident, questioned what is the cost of the Health Insurance coverage

Personnel Director Eldridge stated it varies. He stated a lot of the elected officials in the Legislature do not take it, because they have coverage elsewhere. He stated those that take it the Family Plan runs approximately \$24,000 and the Individually Plan runs approximately \$9,000.

Lynne Eckardt, resident, stated then in addition to the salary they receive the Health Insurance, if they opt to accept it.

Commissioner Carlin stated that the Legislators contribute 25% if they do take the County's Health Insurance plan.

Lynne Eckardt, resident, questioned if there is also Dental Plan coverage.

Personnel Director Eldridge stated that there is a Dental Plan, but not vision plan. He stated the Legislators do not pay into the Dental Plan.

Legislator LoBue stated that she looked into the pay scale for the Dutchess Legislators. She stated that Dutchess County's population is just under 300,000. She stated the Legislator salary in Dutchess is \$15,400.

Chairwoman Nacerino stated that she believes that to be a moot point, as it has been that way for years. She stated she believes Legislator LoBue is bringing forward a rationale that defies what she has worked for, for the last nine (9) years.

Legislator LoBue stated the County Executive's salary is going from a current salary of \$151,608 to 2018 proposed salary \$155,209. She stated the Westchester County Executive salary is \$160,000. She stated the Westchester County Executive manages an approximate \$2 billion budget.

Lynne Eckardt, resident, stated out of the ten (10) neighboring Counties Putnam County will be the second highest, behind Westchester County. She stated that she believes the Legislature of Putnam County has the easiest county to govern. She explained that she believes that because Putnam County does not have any urban areas and the population is approximately 100,000. She stated that she would take this action under advisement, it is a huge increase.

Chairwoman Nacerino stated that the Legislators gave this serious consideration before the moved forward with the proposal. She thanked Ms. Eckardt for her comments. She stated that she does not agree that making an assessment based on what is done in surrounding counties, in this particular case, makes much sense. She stated that she does know that in Westchester

County the Legislators receive a stipend for each committee they are on and for other work that they do. She stated she is not aware of the amount of the stipend or if it is included in the salary of what was quoted this evening. She stated she stands with conviction that the proposed raise for the Legislators of Putnam County is deserved, for the job that is done and will continue to be done. She stated that the County Legislator position compared to a Town elected official is vastly different.

Item #5) Other Business - None

Item #6) Adjournment

There being no further business, at 7:58P.M. Chairwoman Nacerino made a motion to adjourn; Seconded by Legislator Albano. All in favor.

Respectfully submitted by Diane Trabulsy, Deputy Clerk of the Legislature.